

REVIEW

of professor engineer Veliko Panchev Petrov, PhD, professor at the Information Security Department, Faculty of Artillery, AD and CIS, of *Vasil Levski* National Military University, GSM 0887948050, e-mail: veliko_pp@abv.bg

of the scientific papers presented at the competition for occupation of the academic position "Associate Professor"

for a full-time academic position for an officer in the Joint Operations and Planning Department of the National Security and Defense Faculty at the VA “G.S. Rakovski” in the field of higher education 9. “Security and defense”, professional field 9.2. “Military Science” under the Doctoral Program in Organization and Management of the Armed Forces in the subjects of “Operational Art in Joint and Multinational Operations”, “NATO Operations Planning”, “Crisis Response Operations” and “Information Operations” , announced by order of the Minister of Defence of the Republic of Bulgaria No. OX-460 / 16.05.2019 and promulgated in the State Gazette no. 51 / 28.06.2019

of the sole candidate in the competition:

lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhivko Dobrev Zhelev, Principal Assistant in the Joint Operations and Planning Department of the National Security and Defense Faculty at the VA “G. S. Rakovski”

Shumen

2019 г.

1. Which of the submitted by the applicant papers are accepted for evaluation by the reviewer?

The competition for the occupation of the academic position “Associate Professor” in the field of higher education 9. “Security and Defense”, professional field 9.2. "Military Art" under the doctoral program "Organization and Management of the Armed Forces" is conducted in compliance with all legal and procedural requirements with the participation of one candidate - lieutenant colonel PhD Zhivko Dobrev Zhelev.

In the competition, the applicant has submitted general scientific output as follows:

- a dissertation, an abstract and 3 reports in a volume of 284 pages, which were reviewed upon receipt of the educational and scientific degree "doctor" and are not offered for review for the current competition;

- monograph - 1 pc. in a volume of 140 pages;

- book (co-authored) - 1 pc. in volume of 236 pages;

- scientific publications (reports) - 15 pcs. in volume of 120 pages (for review 118 pages);

- scientific publications (articles) - 10 pcs. in volume of 88 pages (for review 75 pages).

A total of 27 papers submitted for review with total volume of 670 pages (for review 336 pages). Out of the total list of accepted materials for review, 22 are copyrighted and 5 are co-authored or developed within teams. Two articles were published in English in a foreign journal with an impact factor.

According to my review, all scientific papers submitted for evaluation are in compliance with the legal requirements and do not repeat the publications submitted for the doctoral degree. I fully accept the scientific papers proposed for review, since they fully correspond to the topic of the announced competition and present the author as a serious and thorough researcher.

The citation reference indicates the reflection of the candidate's scientific

publications in the literature with a total of 16 known citations.

The information provided within the meaning of Art. 2b, para 1 of ZRAS RB for fulfillment of the minimum national requirements with attached relevant evidences included in the presented scientific production by groups of indicators and number of points from lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhivko Dobrev Zhelev, shows a total of 536 points in the indicator groups, which exceeds the required 400 points for occupying an academic position of associate professor in the field of higher education 9. Security and defense, professional field 9.2. "Military" (the sum of the points for the individual indicators D and E is significantly exceeded).

The monograph was developed by the applicant independently, and the proposed textbook, reports and co-authored articles correctly indicated the authors' team and co-authors with separation protocols.

I didn't know the facts that would call into question the authenticity of the work and the contribution of the author. An overall analysis of the applicant's output indicates that he is an established researcher on these issues, and the titles submitted for review fully meet academic requirements and standards.

2. General characteristics of the applicant's research, applied and pedagogical activity.

Lieutenant colonel PhD Zhelev graduated from the Higher School of Economics "P. Volov "Shumen in 1999 specialty "Ground Artillery and PTURS "and acquired the qualifications: military officer and master engineer (civilian specialty: computing). From 1999 to 2002 he was a senior battery officer, and from 2002 to 2009 he was successively commander of a self-propelled artillery battery, commander of a combat support company and commander of a self-propelled mortar battery in various military units of the Bulgarian Army.

Successfully graduated from "G. S. Rakovski "in 2011, majoring in "Organization and Management of Operational-Tactical Formations by the Land Forces ". From 2011 to 2012 he was Chief of Staff of the Artillery Battalion of 4 AR in Asenovgrad.

Since February 2012 he is a PhD student in full-time training in the Department of Operative Arts, and in 2014 he successfully defended his PhD in the scientific specialty 05.12.01 "Organization and Management of the Armed Forces" at VA "G. S. Rakovski".

Since December 2014 he has been an Assistant Professor in the Operative Arts Department, and since February 2016 he has been Assistant Professor in the same Department. From July 2016 to the present time, Dr. Zhelev is Principal Assistant in the Joint Operations and Planning Department of the Military Academy, G. S. Rakovski "Sofia.

He has undergone several training courses and they are as follows: for artillery battery commanders, in English - 1, 2 and 3 level, research methodology, strategic communications, joint definition and defeat of objectives and strategic course. All this contributes to his career development, where he skillfully combines his theoretical background with his practical skills, which allows him to emerge as a very good teacher - lecturer, leader of seminars and practical classes.

The submitted papers for review have been published as a priority by various scientific events in VA "D. S. Rakovski", in the "V. Levski", in the magazine "Military magazine", in the magazine "Bulgarian science" and in a foreign magazine with an impact factor. They are distinguished by their academic, professional and readable style.

An analysis of the scientific papers submitted for review indicates that the applicant has focused his / her research and research interests in several thematic areas:

1. Research on the problems of **information operations**, mainly related to the development of information impact capabilities, the construction and development of information operations capabilities, military misconduct, impact technologies, misinformation, information warfare, electronic warfare and security operations as elements of information operations, with the planning of information operations, with the characteristics of the current information environment and its impact on the Nittel operations. The papers in this thematic area are: monograph (2.2.32.) And scientific reports and articles (2.1.1.7; 2.1.1.8; 2.1.1.9; 2.1.1.10; 2.1.1.12; 2.1.1.14; 2.1.1.15; 2.1.1.16; 2.1.1.17; 2.1.1.21; 2.1.1.22; 2.1.1.25; 2.1.1.26; 2.1.1.27; 2.1.2.29. And 2.1.2.30.).

2. Studies in the field of **operational art**, mainly related to the dimensions of the main operational factors affecting the planning and conduct of joint operations, the problems in determining the actual combat capabilities, the planning of fire support in joint operations, the use of operations under military delusion, with the development of the views and principles of military and operational art (until the Napoleonic Wars, from the Napoleonic Wars to World War II and after World War II, and so on in modern terms), with Russian forces in Syria and military science and national interests of the Russian Federation. The papers in this thematic area are: a textbook (2.2.31.) And scientific reports and articles (2.1.1.6; 2.1.1.11; 2.1.1.13; 2.1.1.18; 2.1.1.19; 2.1.1.20; 2.1.1.23.; 2.1.1.24. And 2.1.1.28.)

Submitted papers for review by lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev distinguished himself by considering current issues in military theory and practice, outlining a consistent and systematic scientific activity of the candidate and directly related to the thematic area of the announced competition. Careful analysis of his scientific output allows us to ref. lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev should be identified as a consistent researcher and professional educator promoting his research and achievements in the field of security and defense. The professional experience gained as a commander and teacher, researcher and innovator has been directly reflected in his scientific output and fully meets the requirements for occupying the academic position of Assistant Professor in the professional field of Military Affairs.

3. Assessment of the candidate's pedagogical preparation and activity.

Currently, lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev is Principal Assistant in the Joint Operations and Planning Department of the Military Academy, G. S. Rakovski". According to the attached reports, he teaches several major disciplines, the most important of which are:

1. Operational art in multinational and joint operations;
2. Planning for NATO operations;
3. Crisis response operations;

4. Information operations.

A comparative analysis of the disciplines and the works developed shows that the candidate's educational and research activities are combined in productive creative unity.

The applicant is fluent in English at 2.2.2.2 level. according to the requirements of STANAG 6001.

My personal observations allow me to determine lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev as a well-prepared, diligent and erudite officer and lecturer with positive experience, a high general culture, innovative spirit and a developed sense of responsibility.

4. Main scientific results and contributions.

The main scientific results of lieutenant colonel PhD Zhelev may be reduced to a thorough analysis of the existing theory: the organization, preparation and conduct of information operations and information impact; for planning of information operations; the planning and conduct of joint operations; for planning fire support in joint operations and tracking the development of views and principles of military and operational art for a long period from before the Napoleonic Wars and up-to-date conditions.

The scientific and applied contributions of the papers submitted for review are related to the following:

- existing and new scientific knowledge related to the nature, content, basic characteristics and conduct of information operations and information impact have been expanded and supplemented: works (2.2.32; 2.1.1.7; 2.1.1.8; 2.1.1.10 2.1.1.14 and 2.1.1.21.) From the list of scientific production;

- the existing theory in the field of capacity building, conducting and planning of information operations in conflicts has been supplemented: works (2.1.1.7; 2.1.1.8; 2.1.1.10; 2.1.1.22; 2.1.1.27; 2.1. 2.29. And 2.1.2.30.) From the list of scientific production;

- the existing theory of information warfare, electronic warfare and security operations has been supplemented as elements of information operations: works (2.1.1.16; 2.1.1.17; 2.1.1.25.) From the scientific production list;

- the methods for achieving suddenness in the operations of military formations in conducting operations, the use of new means of misinformation and misleading the enemy

have been expanded and supplemented: works (2.1.1.11; 2.1.1.12 and 2.1.1.15;) from the list of scientific production;

- the existing knowledge about the nature and main characteristics of the information and the information environment is enriched: works (2.1.1.9; 2.1.1.21 and 2.1.1. 26.) from the list of scientific production;

- the issues were clarified and the evolution of the views and principles of military and operative art up to the Napoleonic wars, from the Napoleonic wars to the Second World War, after the Second World War and in contemporary conditions: works (2.1.1.18; 2.1.1.19; 2.1.1.20. And 2.2.31.) From the list of scientific production;

- scientific and theoretical formulations for planning of fire support in joint operations and the influence of the environment on conducting operations have been enriched and further developed: works (2.1.1.13. And 2.1.1.23.) From the list of scientific production.

The obtained scientific and applied scientific results and contributions from the candidate's research reveal and emphasize the focus of his work on the development and formation of capabilities for conducting information operations, information impact and for planning and conducting joint operations in the modern security environment. The papers present the candidate as an accepted and approved expert on the mentioned issues, which is confirmed by his active teaching and research work on these issues.

5. Assessment of the importance of contributions to science and practice

In accordance with the accepted conditional grouping of contributions into two thematic areas in the works of lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev and their analysis, it can be concluded that they mainly cover the range of science, including the study of existing, the enrichment and further development of modern theories, the study and enrichment of the theory and practice of military science in the field of information operations and participation of the armed forces in them. They are both scientific and practically applied. From the point of view of military science, these contributions are useful, original and significant.

Developed by lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev monograph as well as the textbook are widely used in the educational process of the Military Academy "G. S. Rakovski ”.

The two English language articles published in a foreign magazine with an impact factor are highly appreciated.

The candidate's scientific papers are the basis for future scientific developments and can be successfully used in the preparation of listeners and students studying at the VA "D. S. Rakovski ”.

6. Assess the extent to which the contributions are made by the applicant

Following the development of the scientific growth of lieutenant colonel PhD Zhelev, allow me to express my conviction that the above mentioned scientific and applied contributions are a personal work of the applicant and are the result of his many years of creative and research activities. Lieutenant colonel PhD Zhelev is fluent in the specialized terminology in the scientific field of his creative research, which allows him to easily apply it in his works by presenting them in a professional and accessible language for the audience.

7. Critical notes on the submitted works of the applicant

The following critical notes may also be made to the materials submitted for review:

- in some publications the cited literature has not been designed according to accepted standards;
- due to their small volume (4-6 pages), some of the scientific reports and publications do not provide opportunities for full analysis, justification of the issues studied and summaries;
- a major part of the published scientific works concern a strictly specific audience, which narrows the possibilities for active participation in the scientific exchange and protection of innovative scientific ideas.

The weaknesses indicated are of a recommended nature and do not in any way

diminish the value of scientific output and the scientific and applied contributions of the above lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhivko Zhelev, demonstrating his ability to develop independently and in a team important military science issues.

I recommend the lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev to issue textbooks or teaching aids in his future teaching activities in the course disciplines.

8. Personal impressions

I know the lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev for about 25 years as a cadet at the “Panayot Volov” Artillery and air defence School in Shumen and I think he has excellent theoretical knowledge and practical skills, he has the necessary staff culture and organizational experience, which allows him to easily train different categories of students (officers and students) and to form the necessary knowledge and skills.

The interdisciplinary nature of his scientific research allows for active participation in the educational process of the Joint Operations and Planning Department in a wide range of higher education disciplines 9. Security and Defense.

I have had joint publications with the candidate.

9. Conclusion

Applicant's teaching, research and application activities lieutenant colonel PhD. Zhelev shows that he fully complies with the requirements of the Academic Staff Development Act and the Rules for its implementation. This gives me a reason to suggest to the Scientific Jury to choose a lieutenant colonel PhD Zhivko Dobrev Zhelev, to take the academic position of Assistant Professor in the Joint Operations and Planning Department of the National Security and Defense Faculty.

10. Assessment of the applicant.

The acquaintance and research of the scientific production presented by the announced competition for “associate professor” lieutenant colonel PhD Zhelev, the sole participant in the competition, gives me a reason to give my positive assessment of the candidate's achievements and propose to the distinguished Scientific Jury of the

competition to rank the candidate, lieutenant colonel PhD Zhivko Dobrev Zhelev, and to propose to the Faculty Board at the National Security and Defence Faculty of VA “G. S. Rakovski” to be elected and to occupy the academic position of “ associate professor ”in the field of higher education 9.“Security and Defence”, professional field 9.2. "Military Art", under the doctoral program "Organization and Management of the Armed Forces".

19.10.2019 г.

Reviewer:
Professor Doctor

Veliko Petrov